

**Report Identification Number: NY-18-006** 

Prepared by: New York City Regional Office

Issue Date: Jul 09, 2018

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:  A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



# **Abbreviations**

	Relationships	
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult	
	Contacts	
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPS-Child Protective Services		
	Allegations	
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other	
	Miscellaneous	
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police
Service	Services	Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment
	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation		



### **Case Information**

**Report Type:** Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Bronx **Date of Death:** 01/18/2018

Age: 0 day(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 01/18/2018

#### **Presenting Information**

The 1/18/18 report alleged the SM gave birth to a male SC at home on 1/18/18. The report also alleged the SM gave birth to the SC into the toilet. The SM then went to her room and returned about a half hour later to discover that the SC was deceased and in the toilet. The emergency contact number 911 was called and EMS administered CPR when they arrived at the home. The SC and SM were then transported to the hospital.

#### **Executive Summary**

The newborn male infant (SC) died on 1/18/18. The autopsy listed the cause of death as Undetermined (unattended delivery into toilet; cannot exclude stillbirth) and the manner of death as Undetermined.

The allegations of the 1/18/18 report were DOA/Fatality and IG of the SC by the SM.

ACS interviewed a neighbor (identified as N1) and learned that on 1/17/18 in the evening, N1 heard screaming coming from the SM's unit. On 1/18/18, at about 2:15 AM, the N1 heard yelling and some minutes later, the SM knocked on her door and stated she needed help. The N1 went next door and entered the SM's apartment as the front door was open. The N1 observed the SM behind the front door with the umbilical cord still attached to the SM's body. The SM held the SC in her arms, and the N1 found the SC was cold and there was purple/blue bruising around the SC's lips. The N1 placed the SC on the bed, contacted the residential staff and EMS was contacted. The staff provided CPR per EMS instructions.

On 1/18/18, ACS obtained information from LE and determined that the SM provided different accounts of her activities regarding the SC. In one of the accounts, the SM said she was in the bathroom when she observed her umbilical cord come out of her body. The SM acknowledged that a neighbor came to her home; however, the SM changed her account a few times and did not clarify whether the neighbor was with her when she gave birth to the SC. In another account, the SM said she gave birth to the infant in the hospital. She indicated this was her first pregnancy and she provided the BF's name. She said she last spoke with him on 1/17/18. The SM denied there was DV between herself and the BF. She informed ACS that she received prenatal care. SM said she was diagnosed with a clinical issue, but was not using medication due to her pregnancy.

On 1/26/18, the MGM said the hospital referred the SM for counseling services. The MGM said the SM told her she recalled informing the shelter staff that she needed help during security checks, but no one helped.

The ACS documentation reflected the family did not attend an ACS scheduled Family Team Meeting. ACS mailed service referrals to the SM. The SM was discharged from the shelter and she relocated to the MGM's home.

On 3/29/18, ACS contacted the ME's office and was informed the ME was awaiting results of laboratory tests. ACS did not obtain information from the SM's caseworker at the shelter.

On 6/15/18, ACS documented that the autopsy was finalized. The cause of death was listed as Undetermined (unattended delivery into toilet; cannot exclude stillbirth). The manner of death was listed as Undetermined.

On 7/1/18, ACS UNSUB the allegations of DOA/Fatality and IG of the SC by the SM on the basis of no credible evidence. ACS referenced the findings of the ME report that listed the cause and manner of death as undetermined.

NY-18-006 FINAL Page 3 of 10



## Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

#### **Safety Assessment:**

- Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:
  - Safety assessment due at the time of determination?

Yes

#### **Determination:**

• Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?

Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.

• Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?

Yes

Was the decision to close the case appropriate?

Yes

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory  $\ensuremath{\mathrm{Yes}}$ 

or regulatory requirements?

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?

Yes, the case record has detail of the

consultation.

## Explain:

NA

#### **Required Actions Related to the Fatality**

Are there Required	d Actions related to the compliance issue(s)?   Yes   No
Issue:	Contact/Information From Reporting/Collateral Source
Summary:	ACS documentation did not reflect that ACS obtained information from the SM's caseworker at the shelter.
Legal Reference:	18 NYCRR 432.2(b)(3)(ii)(b)
Action:	ACS must submit a PIP within 45 days that identifies the action the agency has taken or will take to address the citations identified in the fatality report. ACS must meet with the staff involved with this fatality investigation and inform NYCRO of the date of the meeting, who attended and what was discussed.
Issue:	Failure to provide notice of report
Summary:	The case record did not reflect that the BF was provided a Notice of Existence of the 1/18/18 report.
Legal Reference:	18 NYCRR 432.2(b)(3)(ii)(f)
Action:	ACS must submit a PIP within 45 days that identifies the action the agency has taken or will take to address the citations identified in the fatality report. ACS must meet with the staff involved with this fatality investigation and inform NYCRO of the date of the meeting, who attended and what was discussed.



## **Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities**

**Incident Information** 

<b>Date of Death:</b> 01/18/2018	Time of Death: 04:13 AM
Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death	: Unknown
County where fatality incident occurred:	Bronx
Was 911 or local emergency number called?	Yes
Time of Call:	03:33 AM
Did EMS respond to the scene?	Yes
At time of incident leading to death, had child used a	lcohol or drugs? N/A
Child's activity at time of incident:	
☐ Sleeping ☐ Working	Driving / Vehicle occupant
☐ Playing ☐ Eating	⊠ Unknown
Other	
Did child have supervision at time of incident leading Is the caretaker listed in the Household Composition At time of incident supervisor was: Unknown if they was	? Yes - Caregiver 1
Total number of deaths at incident event:	
Children ages 0-18: 1	
Adults: 0	

#### **Household Composition at time of Fatality**

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	0 Day(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	22 Year(s)
Other Household 1	Father	No Role	Male	23 Year(s)

#### **LDSS Response**

ACS interviewed hospital medical staff who said EMS responded to the home and found the SC unresponsive on the bed. The SM had stated that she had a bowel movement, returned to bed and about an hour later returned to the bathroom where she observed the SC in the toilet. The SM said she removed the SC from the toilet, brought the SC to the bed and called 911. The attending Dr. said the SC had no visible injuries but the SC was blue in color so it was difficult to observe injuries.

LE informed ACS that it was unclear whether the SM had a clinical health condition. LE said the SM provided different accounts of what occurred, including an explanation in which the SM said she gave birth to the SC in the hospital. LE did



not obtain the details from the SM and had not verified whether the SM was aware of the SC's death.

ACS interviewed another attending Dr. who said the SC appeared to be full term, was not moving and SC's body was cold to the touch. No trauma was observed and the SC's umbilical cord was cut. There was dried blood on the SM in the area in which the umbilical cord had been attached. The Dr. said the SC seemed to be dead more than an hour as the SC was already blue. The Dr. had asked the SM whether she received assistance during delivery, but the SM did not provide a response to the Dr.'s query.

On 1/18/18, ACS interviewed the SM regarding the N1 (who resided in the same shelter). The SM explained that the N1 heard her screams and came to her door.

ACS visited the hospital and interviewed the SM and BF. ACS noted that the SM seemed confused. The SM said she did not know what occurred. The SM said she received prenatal care regularly but could not recall the name of the facility. She was not ill during her pregnancy. SM said her neighbor assisted her in delivering the SC. The BF said he had a telephone conversation with the SM at about 2:15 AM on 1/18/18. The BF said it was not unusual for them to have telephone contact late at night or early morning.

ACS interviewed Neighbor 2 (N2) who had received instructions from the 911 operator over the phone and assisted with CPR. Per N2's account, the SC seemed dead and there was blood on the SC's body.

On 1/22/18, ACS received the SM's hospital discharge summary. The document reflected the SM was discharged to her home with family care and was expected to resume normal activity.

ACS obtained an incident report from the New York City Department of Homeless Services (NYCDHS). The NYCDHS report reflected that at 3:29 AM, N1 informed staff that the SM gave birth and the SC was not breathing. At 3:32 AM, 911 was called and the operator provided instructions to administer CPR. At 3:37 AM EMS arrived.

#### Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Undetermined

**Primary Cause of Death:** Undetermined if injury or medical cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

#### Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? No

**Comments:** The investigation adhered to previously approved protocols for joint investigations.

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

**Comments:** There is no OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team in NYC.

#### **SCR Fatality Report Summary**

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
046341 - Deceased Child, Male, 0 Days	046342 - Mother, Female, 22 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
046341 - Deceased Child, Male, 0 Days	046342 - Mother, Female, 22 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated

NY-18-006 FINAL Page 6 of 10



## **CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine		
All children observed?						
When appropriate, children were interviewed?			$\boxtimes$			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	$\boxtimes$					
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?						
Contact with source?						
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?						
Agency Personnel		$\square$				
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	$\boxtimes$					
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?						
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	$\boxtimes$					
Did the investigation adhere to established protocols for a joint investigation?	$\boxtimes$					
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?						
Additional information: ACS documentation did not reflect that ACS obtained information from the SM's caseworker at the shelter.						
Fatality Safety Assessment Activities						
				Unable to		
	Yes	No	N/A	<b>Determine</b>		
ere there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?						
Legal Activity Related to the Fatality						
Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.						
Have any Orders of Protection been issued? No						
Services Provided to the Family in Response to t	he Fatality	,				

NY-18-006 FINAL Page 7 of 10



Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling			$\boxtimes$				
<b>Economic support</b>							
Funeral arrangements		$\boxtimes$					
Housing assistance						$\boxtimes$	
Mental health services				$\boxtimes$			
Foster care						$\boxtimes$	
Health care						$\boxtimes$	
Legal services						$\boxtimes$	
Family planning						$\boxtimes$	
Homemaking Services							
Parenting Skills						$\boxtimes$	
<b>Domestic Violence Services</b>						$\boxtimes$	
Early Intervention						$\boxtimes$	
Alcohol/Substance abuse						$\boxtimes$	
Child Care							
Intensive case management							
Family or others as safety resources						$\boxtimes$	
Other						$\boxtimes$	
Additional information, if necessary: The MGM said the hospital was referring t	he SM for c	ounseling	services.				
Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? N/A  Explain: There were no surviving siblings or CHN in the household.  Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes  Explain: The MGM reported that the hospital was referring the SM for counseling services.							

# History Prior to the Fatality Child Information

Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death?

No No



Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death?	No
Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this	
Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?	No
Infants Under One Year Ol	d
During pregnancy, mother:	
Had medical complications / infections	Had heavy alcohol use
Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs	Smoked tobacco
Experienced domestic violence	Used illicit drugs
Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed	
Infant was born:	
Drug exposed	With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome
With neither of the issues listed noted in case record	_
CPS - Investigative History Three Years	<b>Prior to the Fatality</b>
	·
There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the	he fatality.
CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Yea	ars Prior to the Fatality
The SM was not known to the SCR or ACS as a subject three years prior t	to the fatality.
Known CPS History Outside of	•
There was no known history outside of NYS.	
Legal History Within Three Years Prior	to the Fatality
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality in	vestigation?
Family Court Criminal Court	Order of Protection
	Sorder of Frotestion
Have any Orders of Protection been issued? Yes	
From: 10/23/2017 To: 11/30/2	2017
Explain:	
The SM had one OP issued against the BF. The effective date of the OP v	was 10/23/17 and it expired on 11/30/17.
Recommended Action(s)	
Recommended Action(s)	
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative of	or policy changes? Yes No

NY-18-006 FINAL Page 9 of 10



Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review?  $\square$ Yes  $\boxtimes$ No