



Report Identification Number: BU-23-009

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: Oct 03, 2023

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:

- A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
- The death of a child for whom child protective services had an open investigation or a CPS monitored services case.
- The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
- The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child’s family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child’s death; whether the child or the child’s family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child’s death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child’s death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child’s household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may **only** be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. **It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child’s siblings or other children in the household.**

OCFS’ review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS’ assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships		
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult	
Contacts		
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
Dr.-Doctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPS-Child Protective Services	DA-District Attorney	
Allegations		
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other	SXTF-Sex Trafficking
Miscellaneous		
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social Service	ACS-Administration for Children's Services	NYPD-New York City Police Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation		



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased
Age: 2 month(s)

Jurisdiction: Erie
Gender: Male

Date of Death: 04/20/2010
Initial Date OCFS Notified: 04/13/2023

Presenting Information

Erie County Department of Social Services (ECDSS) received an SCR report which alleged on 4/20/2010, the mother (SM) was sleeping in the bed with the 2-month-old child (SC). The mother woke up and found the child deceased. The child passed away due to the mother co-sleeping with him. The SCR report also alleged the home was in deplorable condition which the mother failed to address and was a hazard to the 6-year-old sibling. The SCR report was subsequent to a report made 4/12/2023, which expressed the same concerns for the 6-year-old sibling.

Executive Summary

This report concerns the death of a 2-month-old child which occurred in the care of his mother on 4/20/2010. ECDSS received the SCR report and coordinated their response internally.

The mother was interviewed in her home and disclosed as many details of the fatal incident as she could remember. The mother fed the child and placed him to sleep in an adult bed, on top of a pillow and blanket, then fell asleep next to him. The mother awoke to find the child unresponsive, called 911, and the child was transported to the hospital where he was pronounced dead. The mother confirmed placing the child on his back to sleep as she had been advised by the pediatrician, though she had no other knowledge of providing a safe sleep environment.

The father was interviewed by phone and stated the mother made threats to harm the child due to their relationship issues and had no other knowledge of the fatal incident as he was not present. The father stated he had no contact with the mother since the death of their child. ECDSS provided the father's statement to law enforcement following their interview.

ECDSS obtained hospital and law enforcement records in addition to the autopsy report. The law enforcement records showed no criminality in the child's death due to the autopsy identifying the child died of natural causes from co-sleeping. Hospital records confirmed the child was found unresponsive in an unsafe sleep environment by the mother.

The allegations of DOA/Fatality and Inadequate Guardianship against the mother regarding the child were substantiated. Services were offered to the mother and father in relation to the death of the child and the investigation was closed. The mother had since given birth to a now 6-year-old sibling. The 6-year-old sibling was assessed as safe in the care of the mother and the family was referred to additional prevention services and a long-term services case was opened.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

- **Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:**

- **Safety assessment due at the time of determination?** Yes

**Determination:**

- **Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?** Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
- **Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?** Yes

Explain:

There was detailed documentation in the case record of supervisory consult and the decision to open the case for prevention services was made commensurate with the case circumstances.

Was the decision to close the case appropriate? N/A

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements? Yes

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation? Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.

Explain:

There was detailed documentation in the case record of supervisory consult throughout the investigation.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities**Incident Information**

Date of Death: 04/20/2010

Time of Death: 02:22 PM

Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death: 11:30 AM

County where fatality incident occurred: Erie

Was 911 or local emergency number called? Yes

Time of Call: Unknown

Did EMS respond to the scene? Yes

At time of incident leading to death, had child used and/or ingested alcohol or drugs? N/A

Child's activity at time of incident:

- Sleeping
- Working
- Driving / Vehicle occupant
- Playing
- Eating
- Unknown
- Other

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1

Adults: 0



Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	2 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	21 Year(s)
Other Household 1	Father	No Role	Male	26 Year(s)

LDSS Response

ECDSS received the SCR report and coordinated their response with LE. LE had no immediate knowledge of the previous investigation and advised ECDSS to conduct their investigation of the incident while LE gathered further information. ECDSS assessed the safety of the 6-year-old sibling and interviewed the mother in the home.

The mother stated she fed the SC and placed him in bed with her. The SC was placed on top of a pillow and blanket so he would be elevated above the SM. The SM fell asleep after the SC and awoke to find the SC unresponsive with blood coming from his mouth. The SM called 911 and the SC was transported to the hospital where he was pronounced dead. The SM did state her pediatrician at the time advised her to have the SC sleep on his back, although she had no other knowledge of safe sleep practices. ECDSS provided safe sleep education to the SM.

The BF was interviewed by phone. The BF stated the SM threatened to harm the SC if he did not remain in a relationship with her the day of the fatal incident. The BF did not have further knowledge of the fatal incident.

ECDSS interviewed the ME and obtained the autopsy report. The autopsy report stated the SC died of natural causes involving co-sleeping. The ME stated there were no other remarkable findings in the autopsy. ECDSS obtained the hospital records which confirmed the SC was found unresponsive in bed after co-sleeping with the SM. The SC was in cardiac and respiratory arrest upon arrival and pronounced dead following attempts to revive the SC.

ECDSS interviewed LE. LE stated there was no criminal investigation of the SC's death. LE stated it was likely the investigation was closed following the preliminary autopsy report and realization there was no criminality in the SC's death. ECDSS provided the statement by the BF to LE and the ME. No further action had been taken by LE at the time ECDSS closed their investigation.

The allegations against the SM regarding the death of the SC were substantiated. The SM and BF were offered services in relation to the death of the SC, and the investigation was closed. The 6-year-old SS was assessed as safe in the care of the SM and a preventative services case was opened to assist the family further.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Natural

Primary Cause of Death: Undetermined if injury or medical cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Was the fatality referred to an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? Yes



Comments: The fatality was referred to an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team.

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
064773 - Deceased Child, Male, 2 Mons	064774 - Mother, Female, 21 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Substantiated
064773 - Deceased Child, Male, 2 Mons	064774 - Mother, Female, 21 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Contact with source?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality



Child Fatality Report

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Economic support	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Funeral arrangements	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Housing assistance	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mental health services	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Foster care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Health care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Legal services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family planning	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Homemaking Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Parenting Skills	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Domestic Violence Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Early Intervention	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alcohol/Substance abuse	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Child Care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Intensive case management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family or others as safety resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Additional information, if necessary:
 ECDSS was unable to assist with funeral arrangements as the funeral was held 13 years prior to their investigation. Appropriate services were offered and accepted at the time of their investigation.

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? N/A

Explain:

There were no surviving children at the time of the child's death.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

Services were offered and accepted by the SM and BF.

History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information

Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment?

No

Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?

No



Infants Under One Year Old

During pregnancy, mother:

- | | |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Had medical complications / infections | <input type="checkbox"/> Had heavy alcohol use |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs | <input type="checkbox"/> Smoked tobacco |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Experienced domestic violence | <input type="checkbox"/> Used illicit drugs |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Had a positive toxicology at the time of delivery | <input type="checkbox"/> Used prescription drugs |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Used marijuana | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed |

Infant was born:

- | | |
|---------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> With a positive toxicology | <input type="checkbox"/> With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Exhibiting withdrawal symptoms | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> With none of the issues listed noted in case record |

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the fatality.

CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There was no CPS investigative history more than three years prior to the fatality.

Known CPS History Outside of NYS

There was no known CPS history outside of NYS.

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

Additional Local District Comments

We at the Erie County Department of Social Services appreciate the opportunity given us to review the draft report in advance. We find that the facts, as written, accurately describe the unfortunate events and the actions taken in response. We are pleased that OCFS found that the fatality investigation was conducted appropriately and that there are no required actions related to the fatality.

Recommended Action(s)

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No