



Report Identification Number: BU-19-033

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: Feb 27, 2020

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:

- A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
- The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
- The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
- The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child’s family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child’s death; whether the child or the child’s family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child’s death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child’s death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child’s household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may **only** be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. **It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child’s siblings or other children in the household.**

OCFS’ review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS’ assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships		
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult	
Contacts		
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
Dr.-Doctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPS-Child Protective Services		
Allegations		
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other	
Miscellaneous		
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social Service	ACS-Administration for Children's Services	NYPD-New York City Police Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation	ASTO-Allowing Sex Abuse to Occur	



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased
Age: 3 month(s)

Jurisdiction: Chautauqua
Gender: Male

Date of Death: 02/21/2009
Initial Date OCFS Notified: 09/19/2019

Presenting Information

An SCR report was received on 9/19/19 that alleged the three-month-old subject infant had an unknown breathing condition and required a breathing machine. The mother failed to attach the infant to the monitor while he was asleep, and as a result, the infant died on 2/21/09.

Executive Summary

On 9/19/19, the Chautauqua County Department of Social Services (CCDSS) received an SCR report regarding the death of the three-month-old infant, that occurred on 2/21/09. This was the first time the infant’s death was reported to the SCR and the mother and father had no SCR history prior to the infant’s death.

CCDSS conducted a thorough investigation of the infant’s death. They spoke to hospital staff, the medical examiner, law enforcement, fire department, the infant’s pediatrician, and multiple family members and friends. It was learned on the night of 2/21/09, the mother placed the infant to sleep in a car seat at an unknown time. The mother woke the next morning around 9:00 AM and found the infant unresponsive in his car seat. A friend performed CPR and the mother called 911. The infant was transported to the hospital via ambulance, and he was pronounced deceased at 10:23 AM. The father of the infant resided in the home with the mother at that time and he was out of town for work when the incident occurred. The parents had no other children at the time of the incident.

An autopsy was performed following the incident, and the cause of death was Sudden Infant Death Syndrome (SIDS) and the manner of death was natural. Law enforcement investigated the death in 2009 and no criminal charges were filed. They did not re-open their investigation following the receipt of the SCR report, as the infant’s death was due to SIDS and no new information was learned that warranted re-opening the case.

The mother had five children after the infant’s death; the oldest child had the same father as the infant. The mother had a long history of CPS involvement between 2010 and 2018 involving those children. Four of the children were removed from the mother’s custody due to drug misuse, unstable housing, domestic violence, lack of medical care and untreated mental health concerns; two of the children were freed for adoption and two children remained in the custody of relatives. At the time the 9/19/19 SCR report was received, the mother had custody of her two-year-old child. In addition to the DOA/Fatality allegation regarding the infant, it was alleged the mother was misusing drugs while the sole caretaker for the two-year-old child, not properly supervising him, and physically disciplining him. CCDSS thoroughly investigated the allegations and the case was unfounded due to a lack of credible evidence. CCDSS assessed the safety of the two-year-old child and it was determined he was safe in the mother’s care.

The mother had not engaged in bereavement services following the infant’s death and CCDSS referred her for a grief support group. The mother was referred for mental health and substance abuse services and the case was opened for Preventive Services. The father denied needing any services.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality



Safety Assessment:

- Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:
 - Approved Initial Safety Assessment? Yes
 - Safety assessment due at the time of determination? Yes
- Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate? Yes

Determination:

- Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation? Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
- Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate? Yes

Explain:

Casework activity was commensurate with best casework practice.

Was the decision to close the case appropriate? N/A

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements? Yes

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation? Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.

Explain:

The decision to unfound and open the case for Preventive Services was appropriate.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

Incident Information

Date of Death: 02/21/2009

Time of Death: 10:23 AM

Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death: Unknown

County where fatality incident occurred: Chautauqua

Was 911 or local emergency number called? Yes

Time of Call: Unknown

Did EMS respond to the scene? Yes

At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs? N/A

**Child's activity at time of incident:**

- Sleeping
- Working
- Driving / Vehicle occupant
- Playing
- Eating
- Unknown
- Other

Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? Yes**At time of incident supervisor was:**

- Drug Impaired
- Alcohol Impaired
- Distracted
- Impaired by disability
- Absent
- Asleep
- Impaired by illness
- Other:

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1
Adults: 0

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	3 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	No Role	Male	17 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	20 Year(s)

LDSS Response

Upon receipt of the SCR report on 9/19/19, CCDSS searched SCR history, notified the DA's office about the death and contacted law enforcement. Throughout the investigation, CCDSS contacted numerous collaterals to gather information about the infant's death. They spoke to first responders, obtained the autopsy report and reviewed the infant's medical records from the hospital and pediatrician.

Medical records showed the infant was hospitalized overnight on 12/24/08, after he had a choking episode while the father was feeding him. He was diagnosed with a medical condition, prescribed medication, and the parents were advised to elevate the head of the bed 30 degrees. The infant was seen by his pediatrician on 1/9/08 and he was found to be healthy with no medical concerns.

The mother and father both reported the infant needed to sleep in a reclined position, so they used a car seat. On the night of 2/20/09, the father was out of town for work and the mother and her friend were at home with the infant. The mother said she put the infant to sleep in his car seat and she went to bed. She woke up around 9:00 AM and she thought it was odd the infant hadn't woken up around 7:00 AM for his usual feeding. The mother went to check on him and said she "knew he was gone." She took him out of the car seat, the friend performed CPR, and they called 911. Law enforcement arrived and the mother rode in the ambulance with the infant to the hospital. The mother denied using any drugs or alcohol on the night of the incident. She did not provide any additional details about the incident. The father reported he spoke to the mother around 1:00 AM and told her he wanted a paternity test. The mother then called him around 10:00 AM and informed him of the incident. He was concerned that the mother may have done something to cause the infant's death, although the mother denied this.



Child Fatality Report

First responders reported the infant appeared to already be deceased when they arrived. Hospital records and the autopsy report stated the infant had no trauma and his lungs presented with petechia which was consistent with apnea and SIDS.

CCDSS assessed the safety of the two-year-old child throughout the case and offered the necessary services to the mother. CCDSS determined the mother did not have contact with her four other children.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Natural

Primary Cause of Death: From a medical cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? Yes

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
053074 - Deceased Child, Male, 3 Mons	053075 - Mother, Female, 20 Year(s)	Lack of Medical Care	Unsubstantiated
053074 - Deceased Child, Male, 3 Mons	053075 - Mother, Female, 20 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
053074 - Deceased Child, Male, 3 Mons	053075 - Mother, Female, 20 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Contact with source?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>



Child Fatality Report

Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
---	-------------------------------------	--------------------------	--------------------------	--------------------------

Additional information:

CCDSS contacted law enforcement and they did not re-investigate the infant's death.

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to surviving siblings/other children in the household named in the report:				
Within 24 hours?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
At 7 days?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
At 30 days?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
--	--------------------------	--------------------------	-------------------------------------	--------------------------

Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment Profile

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Explain:

The mother was referred for the appropriate services and a Preventive Services case was opened.

Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality Investigation



	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed or placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Were there surviving children in the household that were removed either as a result of this fatality report / investigation or for reasons unrelated to this fatality?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Economic support	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Funeral arrangements	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Housing assistance	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mental health services	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Foster care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Health care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Legal services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family planning	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Homemaking Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Parenting Skills	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Domestic Violence Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Early Intervention	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alcohol/Substance abuse	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Child Care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Intensive case management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family or others as safety resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

**Explain:**

The mother was referred to a grief support group.

History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information

- Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? No
- Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death? No
- Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death? No
- Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death? No

Infants Under One Year Old

During pregnancy, mother:

- Had medical complications / infections
- Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs
- Experienced domestic violence
- Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed
- Had heavy alcohol use
- Smoked tobacco
- Used illicit drugs

Infant was born:

- Drug exposed
- With neither of the issues listed noted in case record
- With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the fatality.

CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS history more than three years prior to the fatality.

Known CPS History Outside of NYS

There is no known CPS history outside of New York State.

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity



Recommended Action(s)

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No